



Rhetoric and Realities: Analysing Corporate Social Responsibility in Europe (RARE)

A Research Project within the EU's Sixth Framework Programme

Deliverable 16: Corporate Social Responsibility and Gender Equality in the Banking Sector – a Case Study

www.rare-eu.net

The RARE project consortium includes: Öko-Institut e.V., Fridjof Nansen Institute, Stockholm Environment Institute, Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei, Budapest University of Technology and Economics, Institut für Sozialökologische Forschung and Peter Wilkinson Associates.

EU project contract No. CIT2-CT-2004-506043

Content

1	Introduction	5
2	Gender Equality Issues in the Private Sector in General and in the Banking Sector in Particular	6
2.1	CSR Activities for Gender Equality in the Banking Sector	7
2.2	Main Gender Issues in RARE's Banking Survey and in the Case Studies.....	9
3	Gender Impact Assessment of Two Cases: Caja Madrid (Spain) and Dexia (Belgium, France, Luxembourg,)	9
3.1	Short Description of the Two Banks.....	9
3.1.1	Caja Madrid.....	9
3.1.2	Dexia	10
3.2	CSR Instruments Used in the Two Banks.....	11
3.3	Impact Analysis of CSR Activities for Gender Equality	15
3.3.1	Impact Analysis of Caja Madrid's CSR Activities for Gender Equality.....	15
3.3.2	Impact Analysis of Dexia's CSR Activities for Gender Equality.....	19
4	Analysis and Explanation of CSR Success	24
4.1	Similarities and Differences of the Two Cases	24
4.2	Analysis of the Cases along Four Questions Tackling Success.....	26
4.2.3	Why are some CSR instruments more conducive to impact on gender equality than others?	27
4.2.4	What factors determine a company's instrument choice?.....	28
4.2.5	What factors drive an effective implementation of CSR strategies and instruments?	31
4.2.6	Why do certain instruments create more impact on some companies than on others, even though as effectively implemented?	34
4.3	Synthesis	34
5	Conclusions and Recommendations	35
6	References	41

Corporate Social Responsibility and Gender Equality in the Banking Sector – a Case Study

Irmgard Schultz, Institute for Social-Ecological Research

1 Introduction

This paper is looking for success factors of corporate social responsibility (CSR) promoting gender equality in the banking sector. By success factors we mean conditions that are promoting positive impacts on society and the environment through CSR activities in the companies.

The report is based upon results from previous elaborations of the RARE project. These are above all: RARE's model of impact assessment and the project's understanding of success factors (WP2, WP 3), insights from a Policy Paper on Gender Equality (Schultz 2007), a background paper on "Equal opportunity measures in the private sector in Europe" (Kreetz 2005) and conclusions from an international workshop on "Rhetoric and Realities of Gender Activities in CSR" (ISOE 2004). This is done within the important empirical framework of the results of RARE's Survey in the Banking Sector (Viganò and Nicolai 2006), in which seventeen leading European banks participated. Two of them were chosen for best practice in the field of gender policy. They agreed to answer further questions during in-depth interviews and added more background information to the information already given in the survey: *Caja Madrid/Spain* and *Dexia/Belgium, France, Luxembourg*. The results of these interviews and the analysis of the background information provided are the basis of this paper.

The core analysis consists of two analytical steps. First, an impact assessment is carried out for each bank's CSR activities. The analysis of CSR impacts stresses the distinction between outputs, outcomes and impacts of CSR activities according to the definition of RARE's impact assessment model. The second analytical step consists of a success analysis against the background of the results of the impact assessment. The explanation of success in achieving outcomes within the company and societal impacts will be guided by four research questions elaborated by the RARE project.

The report comprises five chapters: After this introduction (chapter 1) some information will be given on gender equality issues in the public and private sectors, with a special focus on the banking sector (chapter 2). After that, the insights of the impact assessment of CSR activities related to gender equality are presented (chapter 3). The report starts with the case of Caja Madrid and then goes on to demonstrate main findings of the case study of DEXIA. The next chapter discusses success factors related to the RARE project's research questions (chapter 4) and the last chapter gives a synthesis of both cases and substantiates conclusions concerning success factors for CSR gender activities (chapter 5).

2 Gender Equality Issues in the Private Sector in General and in the Banking Sector in Particular

Gender equality plays an important role in sustainable development. Since the UNCED conference in Rio de Janeiro 1992, a strong international women's lobby has been participating in the "Rio process". Women have been given "major group"- accreditation status in UN policies. "Major groups are stakeholders in society whose involvement is essential to sustainable development." (WEDO 2002:25). Women lobby organisations, being part of international feminist movements, understand their activities and efforts in a broader perspective on societal transformation that focuses on the elimination of structural causes of unequal gender relations. With this perspective, the term "gender" is not just another word for "women" but a concept that takes seriously a norm of equality with respect to gender and also with respect to the relationship between women and men. The concept of gender equality has been defined as follows. The UN World Economic Forum explains it as: "Gender equality refers to that stage of human social development at which the rights, responsibilities and opportunities of individuals will not be determined by the fact of being born male or female, in other words, a stage when both men and women realize their full potential" (World Economic Forum 2005:2). The EU defines it as, "Gender equality is a fundamental right, a common value in the EU, and a necessary condition for the achievement of the EU objectives of growth, employment and social cohesion" (Commission of the European Communities 2006a). In this sense, gender equality is inscribed in the Treaty of Amsterdam of the European countries (European Communities 1996/1999). The treaty created obligations for the political strategy of gender mainstreaming as a new instrument for gender policy in Europe (see more in detail Schultz 2007). Strategically, gender mainstreaming implies "The systematic consideration of the differences between the conditions, situations and needs of women and men in all Community policies and actions." (Council of Europe 1998) It is a strategy additional to that already practiced of launching positive actions and measures for women (Hafner-Burton, Pollack 2002; Luxembourg Presidency 2005; Moser 2005; Shaw 2002; Verloo 2005; Walby 2005). Even though EU legislation defined in 1957 a principle of equal opportunities, providing that women and men receive equal pay for equal work (Article 119 of the Treaty of Rome of 25 March 1957, European Community 1957), nevertheless at work women and men are still being treated unequally. A compilation of equal opportunity issues in the private sector as discussed in literature¹ shows three predominant 'gender gaps':

- (1) *Gender pay gap*: There is a substantial gap between the average earnings of men and women which can only partially be explained by the differences in qualifications and jobs. Even if women have positions in higher-level occupations their pay lags behind that of males, across all employment categories (Thewlis et al. 2004: 91). The last EU report on equality between women and men states: "In 2004, the

¹ The compilation was elaborated for RARE project by Tanja Kreetz (2005) and is free to be downloaded. See www.isoe.de

estimated pay gap between women and men in the EU was 15%, one point below its level in 1999. 17 Member States reported a slight decrease of the pay gap over that period while it remained unchanged in three others. Five countries reported an increase of the gender pay gap since 1999: Belgium, Slovakia, Portugal, France and Germany” (Commission of the European Communities 2006 b).

- (2) *Gender gap in top positions (managerial posts)*: There is a lack of opportunities for women to advance in business careers. Women are underrepresented in training and seminars that are especially relevant for career advancement (Ebner 2004: 208; Kreetz 2005:2). Recent findings suggest that every third European business-woman in top firms aspires to obtain a senior leadership position within her organisation (Catalyst 2002, 2004). However, there are still only few women in management positions throughout the continent. The last EU equality report counts 32% of women as being managers in European companies. The women's share of top management positions in firms (i.e. membership of the daily executive bodies of top companies) is 10%. But this varies greatly between countries (Commission of the European Communities 2006 b).
- (3) *Gender gap in taking part time work*: There is over-representation of females in part-time jobs (four fifth of the part-time workforce in Europe is female) as well as in other forms of flexible working arrangements, while training is often exclusively being offered to the full-time staff. The gap – as well as the lack of paternity leave, the overrepresentation of women in short-term employment and unstable contracts – contributes to the pay gap (Browne 2002). It affects the possibilities of reconciliation of work and life. Though companies are already carrying out much activities “beyond their legal obligations” to close this gap (The Conference Board 2006, EGGSIE 2005), career breaks for women because of maternity and care responsibilities are still determinant. At many workplaces gender specific stereotypes have remained and contribute to the reproduction of the traditional distribution of power balances in the labor market and in families. (Kreetz 2005:3, Commission of the European Communities 2006:, Roadmap for equality, Key action 5). Latest data about gender equality show that in almost all European countries women (aged 20–49) with children have lower employment rates than those without. In 2004, 32.6% of women worked part-time, while this was the case for only 7.4% of men (Commission of the European Communities 2006b).

2.1 CSR Activities for Gender Equality in the Banking Sector

CSR activities of banks related to the above presented gender issues are manifold (Kreetz 2005, Viganò and Nicolai 2006). As legislation differs with respect to gender equality in the private sector and above all with respect to the secrecy of pay scales within the different European countries (Schultz 2007) companies have much space to “act beyond laws” just by setting targets and mechanisms in order to establish equal opportunities and equal pay for women and men.

An industry survey on *CSR in the banking sector of stock market companies* shows that many efforts already are made by the banks to promote equal opportunities. “Many banks have introduced programmes and procedures to support their equal opportunities policy. These concern diversity groups, diversity training, mentoring, compliance procedures, monitoring, etc. So far, the intended results have not been achieved. Banks still seem to be characterised by a male-oriented culture: career prospects are strongly influenced by the time invested by employees.” (Stock at Stage 2004) An overview of *CSR activities of European saving banks which are not stock market listed* also demonstrates serious engagement in CSR bringing about a lot of activities to promote gender equality (European Saving Banks Group 2006). However, data on gender equality in the banking sector document the strong demand for more and more efficient efforts to change traditional inequalities between women and men. Although the participation rate of women among the whole workforce is relatively high in the banking sector compared to other sectors (GM – Consult – MV 2003: 24; Krell, Ortlieb 2003) the proportion of women in top management positions is still only average (8%) in comparison with other sectors (EPWN and Egon Zehnder International 2004: 15).

When it comes to the share of women among employees and managers in the banking sector in Europe two features can be identified: firstly, the share of women decreases steadily from junior to senior positions in all countries (vertical segregation), and secondly, the Anglo-Saxon and Scandinavian banks have the highest proportion of females among employees and managers, while the numbers of females are lowest in Southern European banks. While the share of women in Anglo-Saxon banks lies at 61.5% among all employees and at 22.2% among the managers, women constitute only 45.6% of all employees and 14% of all managers in Western European banks. Looking at the Southern European banks, it is even less likely for women to be among the (managerial) staff. Only every third employee is a woman and only 7.9% of the managers are female. (Kreetz 2005: 29).

Key Performance Indicator for Gender Equality

The share of women of the total workforce in relation to the share of women in managerial positions expresses causes for gender relations in a comprehensive way. Thus it is taken as key performance indicator in international debate.² In order to evaluate the results of a company’s CSR activities for gender equality with regard to their societal impact we also will use this key indicator in our impact analysis.

² In the international debate on indicators this one is taken as overall indicator for gender equality by the Ethical Investment Research Service, according to an interview of Grosser and Moon with EIRIS (Grosser and Moon 2006:7)

2.2 Main Gender Issues in RARE's Banking Survey and in the Case Studies

Against the backdrop of an analysis of EU laws, directives and strategies concerning gender equality in the workplace (Schultz 2007) the RARE project is focussing on four gender issues in its empirical studies. The first and second issues refer to the above described gender gaps regarding equal opportunities: (1) *equal opportunities and equal pay*, (2) *reconciliation of work and family life: work- life balance*. The third gender issue refers to the antidiscrimination principle which is highly regulated by laws. Nevertheless there is room for companies to promote antidiscrimination 'beyond laws'. As a predominant example RARE project has chosen: (3) *antidiscrimination with regard to sexual harassment*. Additionally, against findings of current regulation of financial products, a fourth gender issue is chosen for the banking sector: (4) *equal access to and supply of banking services*. The outcome and societal impacts and also the success factors concerning these four gender issues will be focused on in the analysis of the two banks' CSR activities. The above presented data (European average) will be taken as a kind of benchmark to measure societal impacts of activities related to these gender issues.

3 Gender Impact Assessment of Two Cases: Caja Madrid (Spain) and Dexia (Belgium, France, Luxembourg,)

The two banks were chosen by the RARE team because both of them are well known for their social engagement including gender issues. Thus the analysis of success factors can concentrate on a comparative focus. A more detailed description of the two banks is presented in sub-chapter 3.1. The next sub-chapter (3.2.) describes the CSR instruments chosen by the two banks. Then the impact analyses of Caja Madrid (3.3.) and Dexia (3.4) are presented.

3.1 Short Description of the Two Banks

3.1.1 Caja Madrid

Caja Madrid is a Spanish saving bank which is not stock market listed. Saving banks make about half of Spain's financial system. In the eighties a new law in Spain put banks and saving banks on the same legal footing. Since 1988 saving banks have been allowed to open branches beyond their 'home region'. Caja Madrid (CM) is present all over Spain with more than 1,900 branches and more than 6.7 million clients. CM takes fourth place in the Spanish financial sector-ranking with respect to total assets, loans and customer funds. Net operating income (2005): 1,408 millions EUR. The main activities and products of the saving bank are as well business with clients (saving, loans, cards, pension plans, mutual funds, insurance, securities) as investment banking (bilateral and syndicated loans, bond underwriting and placement, project finance, commercial credit, treasury lines, guarantees, interest rate protection, advisory ser-

vices, appraisal services). As a supplement to its financial activity, the Group holds a portfolio of investments in firms operating in strategic sectors: Mapfre-Caja Madrid Holding, Realia, Endesa, Indra, Iberia and NH Hoteles. A series of companies are owned by CM directly or through the 'Corporación Financiera Caja Madrid'.

Historical background: The history of the bank goes back to Monte de Piedad de Madrid, a pawn broking institution founded on 3 December 1702 by the Aragonese priest Francisco Piquer. Its initial purpose was granting interest-free loans to the poor. It was a charitable organisation under a Royal Board of Trustees, supported by the donations and interest-earning deposits of private individuals - it charged no interest on its loans. The charging of interest on loans was first introduced in 1836. The result was the formation of Caja de Ahorros de Madrid on 25 October 1838, with the purpose of taking small-value deposits from the less well-off. Monte de Piedad and Caja Madrid merged on 22 April 1869 to form Caja de Ahorros y Monte de Piedad, the name which has been kept until today.

Social remit: Caja Madrid (CM) is a financial institution with a social remit. . All saving banks are so called double bottom-line institutions what means that they are offering access to so many household members in society as possible and without compromising profitability. Saving banks relate to the twin of objectives of providing access and still making necessary profit (Peachy 2006, WSBI World Saving Banks Institute 2006). In 2005 CM allocated the amount of 161.2 million EUR (!) for Obra Social (Social Work) and Caja Madrid Foundation. Obra Social spent 51% for welfare activities, 31% for education and training, and 18% for cultural and environmental activities. Caja Madrid Foundation spent 31% on the conservation of Spain's historical heritage, 14% for promotion and diffusion of music, 26% for sponsorship, cultural promotion and exhibitions, and 29% for scholarships, research and universities.

Gender Equality: Caja Madrid is well known for its social commitment at local level. The activities of Obra Social (social work) include many activities which are related to gender equality (programmes of welfare activities, education and training, cultural and environmental activities, which are dedicated to specific social groups such as the elderly, dependent persons, children and young people. etc.). Gender equality issues are integrated into the programmes of Obra Social. For example, activities of Obra Social include promoting houses for battered women as well as numerous activities concerning migrant women. Furthermore, gender equality issues are mostly integrated in human relations (HR) management. HR management concerns 12,731 professionals which are employed at Caja Madrid, 43.4 % of them women. There is training in equal treatment of customers and clients but until now gender equality has not been that much associated with financial products (such as loans, credits, banking services etc).

3.1.2 Dexia

Dexia is the result of a 1996 merger of two major European players in local public finance: Crédit Local in France and Crédit Communal in Belgium. In 2005, Dexia was an employer in 30 countries with 111 companies, managed a total of 114 expatriats

and organised 253 employer mobility operations. Employment has slightly increased in the group with 24,418 employees in 2005 against 24,019 in 2004. Dexia serves two principal markets: local authorities and similar institutions on a global scale and the retail market, mostly in Belgium and Luxembourg. It has developed private banking business for affluent customers in Belgium, Luxembourg, France and other European countries. In 2004 the net banking income was amounting to 5.392 million EUR. Dexia Group has developed specialised activities in the field of asset management, insurance services and fund administration. In fund services, RCB Dexia Investor Services was formed in 2006 as a joint venture with the Royal Bank of Canada and ranks amongst the ten largest custodian banks worldwide. A world-leader in public finance, the Group operates several subsidiaries and branches in 25 countries. Today, Dexia Group ranks amongst the fifteen largest banking groups of the Euro zone (Dexia 2005a).

Social tradition: Responsible business practices are rooted in the bank's main fields of financing and investment: 50% of Dexia's financial activities are concerning "le cadre de vie", infrastructure, building of schools, the environment, societal issues, sustainable development activities. CSR activities fit well into this context. Dexia's citizenship commitment deals with different objectives depending on the features of the respective countries and on the expectations of the local communities. The total amount of the Group's financial commitment in this area lies slightly above EUR 7.1 million, i.e. +15.9% in 2005 compared with 2004 and +13.2% at constant consolidation scope.

Gender activities: Dexia became a prominent example of gender activities within the banking sector in 2004. Implementation of Dexia Group's 'Social Responsibility Action Plan' identified an insufficient number of women amongst the group's top executives. The CEO then initiated an analysis of women's position within the company which was carried out by nine female top executives of the Group, and the result of was published in September 2004: "*White Paper on the place of women in Dexia*" (Dexia 2004). The White Paper underlines the need for Dexia to create better conditions for equal opportunities and diversified management. An internal project on the situation of women was started in Dexia's entities in Belgium, France and Luxembourg in 2005 (Dexia 2005b). Gender distribution of employees: 53.85 % male – 46.15% female (2004).

3.2 CSR Instruments Used in the Two Banks

This compilation of CSR instruments used in the two banks focuses on those instruments which are relevant for activities on gender equality:

Codes of Conduct

Caja Madrid does not participate in any external code of conduct (Global Compact, ILO Tripartite Declaration, OECD Guidelines, Equator Principles, Wolfsberg State-

ments, etc.),³ whereas Dexia participates in several codes of conduct which are the UNEP Statement by Financial Institutions on the Environment and Development (since 1998), the UN Global Compact (since 2002), the Equator Principles (since 2003) and all four Wolfsberg Anti-Money Laundering Principles since their publication. With respect to gender equality and antidiscrimination the UN Global Compact is highlighted in the interview. The UNGC contains a potential to promote activities on gender equality “beyond laws” because it has recently established an alliance with the Global Reporting Initiative (GRI). The UNGC is explicitly referring to antidiscrimination of gendered groups in its Principle 6. Thus, anti-discrimination has been introduced into Dexia’s internal management systems and the equality issues which are defined by GRI have to be reported.

Reporting

Caja Madrid and Dexia annually publish a CSR report (CM) or Sustainability Report (Dexia) using GRI indicators (CM) or indicators of the GRI Financial Services Sector Supplement. The second generation of Global Reporting Initiative (GRI 2002) contained only few categories referring to equal opportunities. A consequent gender break down of all workforce data was missing (Grosser and Moon 2005a: 332) Furthermore, the most important indicator according to the long-lasting persistence of the gender pay gap is treated as “additional indicator” what means that the ‘female – male salary ratio’ is qualified as “important for measuring performance, but does not qualify as a KPI due to local, regional or legal context”. (Global Reporting Initiative 2002). In addition, the GRI Financial Supplement contains the equal pay for equal work indicator but qualifies all internal performance indicators as ‘qualitative’. Thus, trend observation based on quantitative data according to GRI indicators was hardly possible. But this has changed in the next generation of GRI indicators (GRI 2006)⁴

External Management Systems

Caja Madrid uses several external management instruments: ISO 9001 (since 1998), EFQM (since 2003), CMMI (since 2003), British Standard (2004) and ISO 14001 (since 2005). Quality criteria are an integral part of strategic planning taking place in order to obtain a score which is in accordance with the EFQM model. Recommenda-

³ It would be interesting to observe if this will change because of a new trend in the business environment. Competitors of Caja Madrid as for example the saving bank “la Caixa” started to participate in the currently re-formulated *Equator Principles*. Other big Spanish banks started to participate as well. This new trend could force Caja Madrid to join the Equator Principles because of benchmark reasons.

⁴ While producing this report GRI has elaborated the next generation of indicators G3. A European ‘Ad hoc Group on Gender Indicators in CSR instruments’, that was initiated by Kate Grosser/UK, proposed several concretisations of the new indicators as for example the “breakdown by full-time and part-time status, and by gender for each employee category” (L 11: Average hours of training per employee broken down by employee category) and others. The new G3 indicators contain a breakdown of employee categories “according to gender, age group, minority group membership, and other indicators of diversity” (L13) as core indicator and also the “Ratio of basic salary of men to women by employee category” (L 14).

tions from evaluations according to the EFQM model are integrated into the annual planning. Dexia uses ISO 14000, EMAS, OHSAS 18000, the EFQM Model and Social Accountability 8000. But within the different units (countries) of the Dexia Group these management systems are used in different ways. This fact is limiting the analysis of these instruments. In both banks the EFQM model is mentioned predominantly because of its external verification.

Internal Management Systems

In Caja Madrid, all activities are managed through Caja Madrid's Integrated People Management System (CMIPMS). The CMIPM System existed before the establishment of CSR policies, but is now very closely connected to CSR. The CMIPMS as well as the annual CSR report are verified according to the EFQM model using GRI indicators. The CMIPM System guides the main sub-systems of the bank. Through this integrated management tool, CSR serves as an orientation principle to all systems of Caja Madrid. It defines the topics of Human Relations and by doing so also influences the issues of gender equality. Human Resource Management in Caja Madrid is conducted by the guiding principles of its Integrative Personal Guidance System (SGIP: Sistema de Gestión Integral de Personas). SGIPS provides several tools for specific activity fields with a strong impact on gender relations: the Professional Development and Promotion system (PDP), Caja Madrid's Selection Process (Principles), general and specific training programmes and the Professional System of Performance Valuation (S.V.R). Furthermore, there are systems of social benefits, supplementary pension provision and assessment of occupational hazards and of health and safety and finally, a satisfactory (climate) survey. Gender equality is integrated into all these tools implicitly. There are "Norms and Criteria of Behaviour in the Professional Field" which include one chapter on 'Equal Opportunities' (Caja Madrid, Unidad de Medios 2005). The predominant role of the CMIPM System in Caja Madrid's governance model leads to a very *implicit approach* on gender equality.

In contrast, Dexia is well known for its *explicit approach* on gender equality. An important instrument is the internally defined project stemming from the "White Paper on the situation of women in Dexia (Dexia 2004). The objectives of the "White Paper" are integrated into the HR Quality Charter (Dexia 2005c) and the HR annual action plan, the main internal management instruments for Human Relations.

Gender Award Systems

Gender Award Systems are developed independently from CSR activities to promote 'positive actions for women'. In both banks these systems have now become part of CSR activities. They are a kind of management system. Both companies participate in such systems. In Spain the award system is named "Empresa Optima" ("Best Company"). It is ruled by a program named 'Programa Optima'. The Spanish government initiated it in 1996 with help of the EU Structural Fund. Empresa Optima is managed by the Spanish Institute of the Woman (Instituto de la Mujer) which is affiliated to the Spanish Ministry of Work and Social Affairs. To date 61 Spanish and international companies are participating. Caja Madrid started to participate in 2002 (Instituto de la

Mujer 2006, Oficina Internacional del Trabajo 2006, Mujeres universia 2006). Together with the person in charge of the company, officers of the ‘Instituto de la Mujer’ identify objectives for equal opportunities. On this basis they are able to formulate a tailor-made gender action plan for the company. This is related to six defined action categories. Within a specified time frame (one/two years) new objectives and actions will be agreed upon. In Caja Madrid, the action plan of Empresa Optima is verified by Deloitte and Touche, being the company that carries out all external verifications. This external CSR instrument is the only one that is dedicated especially to gender equality.

The case of Dexia illustrates the limits of this instrument. Gender award systems are nationally restricted. Dexia’s unit in France (Dexia Sofaxis) participates in the French “Diversity Charter in the company”, whereas the Belgium bank participates in the Belgium “Charte de l’Apprentissage” and Dexia bank in Luxembourg (Dexia BIL) received the prize for being best employer of women, the Prix Feminin de l’Entreprise. The systems are similar to the one of ‘Empresa Optima’/‘Programa Optima’ in Spain when it comes to promoting positive actions for women, but the main action categories differ as does the institutional organisation (independent entrepreneurial organisations or being a unit of a national ministry). In contrast, the commitments from the White Paper and the actions implied by it are concerning all units of Dexia Group.

	<i>Codes of Conduct</i>	<i>Internal Management Instruments</i>	<i>External Management Instruments</i>	<i>Gender Award Systems</i>	<i>Reporting</i>
Caja Madrid	- no -	CMIPMS, SGIP, HR specific tools	ISO9001 (1998), EFQM (2003), CMMI (2003), British Standard (2004), ISO14001(2005),	Empresa Optima (since 2002)	CSR report, GRI; since 2006: GRI financial supplement
Dexia	UNEP Statement (1998) Global Compact (2002), Equator Principles (2003), all Wolfsberg Principles since publication	White Paper Project (2004), HR Quality Charter (2005), Leadership principle (2006)	ISO 14000 , EMAS, OHSAS 18000, EFQM, social accountability 8000 (different use in different entities!)	Diversity Charter/F ; Charte de l’Apprentissage/Be; Prix Feminin de l’Entreprise/ Luxembg.	SD Report, GRI financial supplement

Table.1: Matrix of CSR Instruments used in Caja Madrid and in Dexia (Source: ISOE 2007)

3.3 Impact Analysis of CSR Activities for Gender Equality

3.3.1 Impact Analysis of Caja Madrid's CSR Activities for Gender Equality

The insights given in this chapter are based on two face-to-face interviews. The first interview took place in Madrid in the quality unit of the bank from 26-27 of September 2006 together with Peter Wilkinson, expert on bribery within RARE project. The second interview had the purpose to specifically clarify questions on CSR activities for gender equality and took place on December 19, 2006 with the Quality Unit and managers of Human Resources. RARE project gives special thanks to Gema Martín Molpeceres, Ignacio Zuniga, Francisca Racionero Sancho and Maria Jose Arasa Cardona from the Quality Unit and Luisa Sagadoy Briones and Maria Mateo from Human Resources of Caja Madrid. More background information was taken from publications in the internet and internal papers that were given confidentially to the RARE team (see all literature of Caja Madrid in the bibliography). Additionally, a background interview with Sara Mateos of the "Instituto de la Mujer" (Institute of the Woman) was held on December 18, 2006. We thank for having provided us with detailed insights into the work of Empresa Optima/ Programa Optima.

The analysis of CSR activities in the banks follows the distinction between outputs, outcomes and impacts of CSR activities according to the definition of RARE's impact assessment model (WP 2).

Caja Madrid's CSR Outputs in Gender Equality

CSR outputs are changes in corporate commitment and strategies with regard to a company's social and environmental performance. As such they include the decision to use a certain CSR instrument. Thus we distinguish CSR instruments used, CSR commitments and CSR strategies in the analysis of outputs.

Instruments used: As already mentioned above, Caja Madrid is not participating in any code of conduct. Most important is its internal integrative management system (CMIPMS), its integrative leadership system (SGIP) and its different specific tools/programmes for Human Relations (HR). The bank participates in the Spanish gender award system 'Empresa Optima'. Furthermore, the saving bank has elaborated a system to identify 'societal needs' to be used when initiating programmes of Obra Social (Social Work). The needs of gender and diversity groups are considered within this.

CSR commitments concerning gender equality: Contributing to more sustainability in society is seen as a fundamental company responsibility. Caja Madrid refers explicitly to sustainable growth of society (Caja Madrid 2005a:2). In this sense corporate social responsibility is a leading principle of the overall orientation of the company. The definition of CSR is taken from the EU Green Paper. Gender equality and the principle of equal opportunity are not mentioned explicitly in this commitment (CSR Report 2005). Equal opportunity is integrated into the programmes of HR and Obra Social via internal codes and agreements.

Strategies concerning gender equality: Caja Madrid has a CSR strategy for the entire CM Group, but there is no overall strategy related to gender equality. Nevertheless, gender issues play an important role in the bank, but the criteria are completely integrated into all systems of the organisation. Goals are annually identified with regard to the different programmes of Human Relation and Obra Social. Furthermore, objectives of ‘Empresa Optima’ are integrated into Human Resource goals and activities.

Caja Madrid’s CSR Outcomes in Gender Equality

CSR outcomes are activities for gender equality that can be proved with regard to their performance. According to this definition the CSR report 2005 does not contain any chapter on activities promoting gender equality. Gender issues which are published in the report are related to Human Resources. Indicators and data were taken over from GRI reporting. They are not very differentiated. They concern: percentage of women 2004/ 2005, percentage of management posts occupied by women 2004/ 2005, percentage of women managers/total women 2004/ 2005, number of nationalities in the workforce, number of persons working in Spain of nationalities other than Spanish, male-female salary ratio (Caja Madrid 2005a: 107). Caja Madrid’s Human Resource unit uses additional indicators. Thus, HR management is able to identify trends and improvements on gender issues.

They are mostly related to the HR annual action plan in which the action plan of the gender award system ‘Empresa Optima’ is integrated. The gender award system in Spain works with a programme (‘Programa Optima’) that distinguishes six defined areas of action: (1) communication and sensitisation for equal opportunity (Comunicación), (2) continuous education and training (Formación), (3) workforce selection (Selección), (4) professional career development (Promoción y Desarrollo Profesional), (5) conciliation of work and family life (Consiliación), (6) impulse committee (Comité de Impulso). Caja Madrid was certified in 2002 and has maintained certification ever since. A person was appointed to have responsibility for ‘Programa Optima’.

HR managers of the bank affirmed that the first participation in “Programa Optima” had caused little change. But since 2002 visible changes and improvements could be observed. Best performance was reached by actions “to make aware all employees, especially people from the HR department, about equal opportunity” (HR manager). Thus, the most substantial improvement within the six defined areas concerns “Communication and sensitisation”. The outcome of different programmes promoting ‘Conciliation of work and family life’ is considered as high and very successful (for example “Working close to home”, “Help with childcare”, “Help for external training and e-learning”). Concerning activities related to this gender issue Caja Madrid provides a specific maternity/paternity service offering information related to parenthood, nursery support for children up to three years, 100% subsidy of the access to website during maternity leave, subsidised activities for children during out-of-school periods. It supports part time work, flexible working time arrangements and return regulations beyond legal entitlements after parental leave. Recently, Caja Madrid accepted a new internal agreement about short-time working up to 12 years (3rd of March 2007). Fur-

thermore, the programme supports parents' initiatives. A substantial outcome is seen in the "permanent analysis of new projects of reconciliation" (HR manager). The outcomes are rather intangible benefits which become obvious in the equal opportunity indicators:

Share of women within the total workforce of Caja Madrid:

2005 (43.40%) – 2004 (43.00 %) – 2003 (42.70 %) – 2002 (42.30%)

Maternity leave coverage: 300 a year in 2005.

With regard to the activity field "*Continuous education/ training*" CM's Human Resource managers see an increased performance through CM's Integrated Personal Management System (CMIPMS) that offers development support and an individual training plan. Good performance is seen in efforts "to promote women participation in actions about career development". The performance is indicated by:

Share of women in management positions which has to be seen in relation to the target of 40 %:

2005 (29.20% of 40%) – 2004 (28.70% – 40%) – 2003 (28.10% – 40%) – 2002 (22.80% – 40%).

With respect to the gender issue 'sexual harassment' Caja Madrid has established a confidential complaints channel. Cases of non-compliance with respectful behaviour are prosecuted according to the internal codes and agreements on professional behaviour.

With respect to the fourth gender issue of '*equal access to and supply of banking services*' Caja Madrid ensures equal treatment by offering equality trainings to CM's customer consultants for developing skills and behaviour for equal treatment in consulting. The survey informs that Caja Madrid is not offering micro-credits⁵.

Caja Madrid's CSR Impacts in Gender Equality

RARE project understands *CSR impacts* as those substantial consequences in the social or environmental realm (outside the company) that result from changes in the companies' social and environmental practices. Thus, gender impacts have to be considered against the background of societal gaps in gender equality which have already been defined and measured or at least well described. To notice substantial consequences of a company's CSR activities the identified CSR outcome on the individual company's level in relation to the national and/or European average situation has to be examined. If a company's outcome is considerably above the national or European level it can be assumed that there is a societal impact. If a company's activities in gender equality are publicly communicated and are referring to the company's responsibility to close gender gaps (in their country/in Europe) the impact can be seen as substantial. The company can be seen as a role model and as a pilot actor to promote gen-

⁵ Beside the information given in the survey there this point was not more explored in detail.

der equality in society. According to this evaluation scheme Caja Madrid's societal impacts of selected key gender issues are presented against the background of average data on Spanish national or EU level:

Caja Madrid's Impact Concerning the Overall Gender Equality Indicator

As mentioned above, this indicator is discussed predominantly in literature on equal opportunities. In Caja Madrid the key performance indicator on gender equality is:

- ➔ 42.7 % of women in the total workforce compared to 28.1 % of women in top positions, which is very good considering the comparative figures:
- ➔ Only 33% of women in total workforce to 7.9% of women in top positions in banks of Southern Europe (see chapter 2, Share of women in management positions in the banking sector).

The gender impact of Caja Madrid concerning the key performance indicator can be evaluated as substantial. It would be even deeper if there was a reference to the societal gender gap in the private sector (banking sector) and if the share of women in the *highest* hierarchical level was communicated.

Caja Madrid's Impact in Closing the Gender Pay Gap

The EU's gender equality policies and women's lobby organisations put high importance on closing the gender pay gap (see chapter 2.1). This issue can be detected in improvements of the female-male salary ratio. The CSR report of 2005 states a relationship of 1:1 which means that there is no gender pay gap. This is a very good result considering the persistent average pay gap: In 2005 in Europe the difference between men's and women's income was around 15%. In Caja Madrid, the statement refers to the relationship within the same remuneration classes. It is unclear on the subject of bonuses. Thus, a clarification of the reporting system and a reference to societal and EU average data would help to deepen the gender impact in this matter.

Caja Madrid's Impact in Closing the Gender Gap in Limited Contracts

The increasing trend of limited contracts especially for female workers and employees is discussed critically as part of the debate on work flexibility and work security. Against the predominant societal trend the percentage of women with unlimited contracts in Caja Madrid Group can be evaluated as very good: 97.7 % of the women have an unlimited contract, whereas the comparative figure from the national statistics institute of Spain (INE, Instituto Nacional de Estadísticas) indicates 36.9 % for the private sector (Caja Madrid 2004 : 2). Caja Madrid itself refers to the national statistics and contributes by communicating its actions and figures publicly in order to fit the societal demand on closing the gender gap. Thus, Caja Madrid serves as a role model by giving an example of what is possible when it comes to contract security even in times of flexible working hours and growing part time arrangements.

Caja Madrid's Impact on Promoting Work – Life Balance

Regarding the issue of work-life-balance (reconciliation of private and professional life) the bank's high amount of activities and programmes to improve reconciliation of

work and family life has a direct societal gender impact. The company is taking responsibility publicly for child and elder care, a topic which within traditional gender stereotypes is seen as a personal (“private”) responsibility of women. Furthermore, the bank’s strong commitment to this issue can be evaluated as a new and pilot form of public-private partnership. The bank is taking responsibility in this field and unburdens the social system e.g. the local and regional governments of Spain of this task. With regard to its social commitment through “Obra Social” Caja Madrid as well as all Spanish saving banks show and communicate the amount of money spent for this purpose as “Dividendo Social” (Social Dividend). One further point concerning the work- life balance should be mentioned: with its leading position in offering flexible working hours, Caja Madrid contributes essentially to diminishing difficulties in reconciliation. Concerning this point the bank is forerunner with some internal agreements which are a model for other companies.

In short: Caja Madrid’s CSR gender activities can be evaluated as having societal impacts. But with respect to the different gender issues the depth of societal impact differs. Against the finding that Caja Madrid communicates its responsibility publicly and serves as role model for other banks in Spain and for the private sector in Europe the impact must be even seen as ‘substantial’. The Madrid local government recently (2006) issued a “Guide to best practises of the flexible and responsible company”. In this guide Caja Madrid is presented as a reference model. The CSR Report of the European Saving Banks Group (2006) also mentions Caja Madrid several times as “best practice”. (European Saving Banks Group 2006)

3.2.2 Impact Analysis of Dexia’s CSR Activities for Gender Equality

The findings presented in this chapter are based on the telephone interview with the sustainable development manager, considerable internal information in print given to RARE team (see literature of Dexia) and a face-to-face in-depth interview with the Human Resource manager Stéphane Gannac on December 1, 2006. The RARE project thanks Mr Gannac for providing this very profound information.

Dexia’s CSR Output in Gender Equality

Gender equality issues in Dexia are mainly integrated in Human Relations (HR) management. The understanding of gender equality and equal opportunities is embedded in a broader understanding of diversity: “For Dexia the notion of diversity includes a broad range of areas e.g. languages, culture, or training and does not just boil down to the ‘non discrimination’ principle or to ethnic diversity.” (Dexia 2005a: SD Report). CSR output is identified with regard to three categories: CSR instruments, commitments and strategies.

Instruments Used

As mentioned above Dexia participates in several codes of conduct of which the UN Gobar Compact is most interesting for gender equality because of its alliance with the

Global Reporting Initiative. External management systems are used differently in different units of Dexia and internal management systems are interesting with respect to Human Resource management and the White Paper project. Dexia in Belgium, France, and Luxembourg participate in national gender award systems.

Commitments for Gender Equality

Dexia Group has a commitment towards sustainable development and corporate social responsibility as well as towards antidiscrimination. Dexia Group's diversity policy revolves around a standard framework including internal and external commitments: Internally: the Principles of Social Management at Group level were signed in 2002, and reaffirmed and clarified in the HR Quality Charter in 2005 (Dexia 2005c). They include principles to improve the situation of women and were taken over from the "White Paper on the situation of women in Dexia" (Dexia 2004). The commitments of the White Paper include ten objectives: 1. sensitisation, 2. training of human resources teams, 3. prohibition of direct and indirect discrimination in internal and external recruitment, 4. favouring the recruitment of feminine talents (no positive discrimination but the headhunting consultancies and the HR teams will have to implement means allowing to presenting an equal number of male and female candidates to managers), 5. better balance of private and professional life, 6. more respect for private time, 7. maternity/ paternity leave, 8. non-linear career development (the Group commits itself to develop a mechanism for employees to succeed in bringing up their children whilst not being penalised in their professional career should they decide to pick up on a developing career, 9. increasing the number of women selected by the entities to participate in skill assessments, increasing the number of women presented by entities for group assessment devices (DEAL), 10. integrating female values (involvement, skill, emotional intelligence, respect for others, time management) in assessing executives (Dexia 2004). External commitments concern national Gender Award systems.

Strategies to Promote Gender Equality

In 2005, Dexia Group undertook a new step in its development by adopting an HR management strategy based on principles that will be common to all entities of DEXIA. In 2005, the process mainly dealt with the position of women. In 2006, the strategy was focussing on the promotion of actions in favour of people with disabilities, of ethnic minorities, of seniors and juniors. But besides these activities the action plan that resulted from the White Paper is continued. The objectives of the White Paper are leading to an action plan with defined time frames. They are monitored every year.

Dexia's CSR Outcome in Gender Equality

CSR outcome in Dexia regarding gender equality is to a certain extent structured by target setting of the White Paper. The White Paper has defined four targets with the following indicators: (1) percentage of women in top executive positions, (2) percentage of women in the nursery of high potential executives, (3) recruitment percentage

of women for executive positions in the main entities, (4) proportion of women presented for entry into the Dexia Assessment of Leadership Device (DEAL).

The first annual monitoring of improvements of White Paper indicators (Dexia 2005b) shows different results, but generally a certain progress for all four targets can be seen. Regarding the first indicator, proportion of women at top executive level, this has improved to almost 10 %. The share of women is 9.3% only amongst the 259 top executives of the Group, 24% of the Dexia high-potential executives and 28% of all executives. Thus, unbalance is particularly evident in the pool of high-potential executives who will be Dexia's management within the next five to ten years. Regarding the second indicator, percentage of women in the nursery of high potential executives, progress is qualified as "rather high" by the HR manager. With respect to the third indicator, recruitment percentage of women for executive positions in the main entities, progress also is qualified as "rather high", whereas the fourth indicator, proportion of women presented for entry into the Dexia Assessment of Leadership Device (DEAL) is showing a rather slow improvement (Dexia 2005b).

Dexia has used the GRI Financial Services Sector Supplement since 2002. HR management uses additional indicators and has developed an own indicator system. GRI is seen as insufficient. The indicators of the White Paper are integrated into Dexia's HR Social Data. Reporting is verified externally by PricewaterhouseCoopers. The last verification for 2006 caused a change in some posts in reporting.

Gender awards and diversity labels can be interpreted as an indication of CSR outcome. In the dominant practice of these award systems companies receive them for activities in gender equality they have already conducted. In November 2005 France Dexia Sofaxis received the 'Equality Label' awarded by the French Ministry for Social Cohesion and Equal Opportunities. In Luxembourg, Dexia Bank (Dexia BIL) received the prize for best employer of women, the Prix Feminin de l'Entreprise, awarded by the Ministry for the Advancement of Women and part of the positive actions programme run by the Ministry. Dexia received the prize for its great effort over a number of years to create the best possible workplace for its employees and to make it easier for them to achieve a work-life balance (creation of a crèche (kindergarden), the opening of a nurse's surgery and a gym, for offering its staff a host of in-house-services – baker's, dry cleaner's, caterer's and a bookshop etc., and providing several organisations to look after children when they are sick).

Concerning *the gender pay gap* this issue was linked to the structure of the company. If women and men are holding the same position, their pay is equal. Nevertheless there is a pay gap as women are hierarchically often working in lower positions than men.

Dexia ensures *anti-discrimination concerning sexual harassment* by establishing preventive measures against sexual harassment and bullying. Even though progress in this matter is seen as "rather low" (HR manager) the prevention of moral harassment is an important topic of Dexia's HR policy. Its entities implement specific action plans in this particular area. In Luxembourg a charter including seven precise commitments against harassment was signed on October 25, 2005.

Dexia's outcome concerning "*Equal treatment in the access to and supply of banking services*" refers to the bank's programmes and supporting measures for micro credits and its guarantee for a basic banking service ("Guaranteeing a basic banking service").

Dexia's CSR Impacts on Gender Equality

According to the evaluation scheme of societal impacts explained above (see 3.3.1 - impacts) Dexia's CSR activities concerning key gender issues are evaluated as follows:

Dexia's impact concerning the overall gender equality indicator:

- ➔ 46.4 of women in the total workforce (2004) to 35.12 % of women in top positions (2004) which has to be seen against the backdrop of the following comparative figures:
- ➔ 45.6% of women in the total workforce to 14% of women in top positions in Western European banks.

According to the key performance indicator the bank qualifies amongst those having societal impact on gender equality. This impact can be called substantial since the bank has established a public communication on gender and diversity issues.

Dexia's impact on equal opportunities

Dexia has started a strong commitment and action plan to improve the situation of women in the bank. However, regarding the first gender issue 'equal opportunities' a certain gap can be observed between a strong output and outcome of the company on one hand and societal impact regarding this issue on the other. First, substantial progress concerning the share of women in executive positions can be observed: 35.12% in 2004 against 27% in 2003 and 25% in 2002 (Source: HR manager). Nevertheless, on a second glance, the analysis of outcomes shows certain persistence with respect to the share of women in the highest hierarchical level. In fact, Dexia has a worse gender ratio in one important area since the only woman on the highest hierarchical level of the company has left the Board due to her retirement. Her successor is again a man. As Dexia follows no positive discrimination strategy the selection was dominated by other criteria. There was no woman among the candidates that matched the specific demands of this Board for this position. The example demonstrates the necessity of long-term strategies within a company and within society. Societal impacts depend on structural contributions not only of one company, but of many companies in the economic sector. HR management in Dexia sees this example as one indicator for the upcoming urge to "search for talents". Banks are already competing for female talents at high management level.

If the outcome of Dexia concerning this gender issue is discussed against the background of statistics on Women in the Board in Europe, the same trend of a very slow and even interrupted improvement can be observed: The percentage of women in managerial positions in the EU has increased by 1 percentage point since 2002, to

reach 31 % in 2003. Very few women (all MS except four do not reach 15 % women) are members of the daily executive boards in the top 50 companies. (Commission of the European Communities 2006: EU Equality report).

Dexia's impact in closing the gender pay gap

Dexia's outcome concerning the gender pay gap is similar to that of Caja Madrid. Within the same income categories remuneration is almost equal between women and men. But as women are less often to be found on the highest levels of income in Dexia a gender pay gap can be observed as well (information of HR manager).

Dexia's CSR impact in promoting work life balance: part-time work

In Dexia, more than 17% of the salaried staff was hired under part-time contracts in 2004 compared to 15.5% in 2003. In this context one should note that in 2004 5.5% of men had part-time contracts compared to 4% in 2003. In Belgium, 55% of Dexia's women are part timers, but men are increasingly doing part time work as well (from 4% to 6%). Compared to the EU average data the share of women taking part-time jobs is 30.5 % in 2004. The corresponding figure for men was 6.6 % (see EU Equality report 2005). Against this background one has to say that Dexia still has to undertake activities merely to reach EU level in this gender issue (part time work of men).

Dexia's CSR impact concerning "equal access to and supply of banking services": Designated societal impact shows Dexia concerning micro-credits and "guaranteeing a basic banking service". Dexia has partnerships with micro-credit organisations. In Belgium it is with Crédal, an alternative credit organisation active in the Walloon and Brussels region that supports social projects by offering loans at low rates supported by management guidance as well as solidarity-based investment solutions. Also Dexia's financial offer of "guaranteeing a basic" has to be interpreted in the context of statistics on poverty risks and social exclusion in Europe, which appear somewhat greater for women than for men at all stages of life, echoing their average lower participation in the labour market. The risk of poverty, in particular, is higher amongst older women and amongst lone parents with dependant children, a group predominantly composed of women." (Commission of the European Communities 2006: Equality report 2006; European Women's Lobby 2005:7). Against this background the bank's supply of a financial product "guaranteeing a basic" has to be evaluated as an important example and contribution to improve gender equality.

In short: Having received several gender and diversity awards for different entities of the company (in different countries) Dexia can be seen as a role model with respect to issues of equal opportunities and to work-life balance. The societal impacts of Dexia's CSR gender activities can be evaluated as 'substantial', though a few points have been identified where societal impact is unclear. But considering the fact that Dexia has started publicly to communicate the situation of women in the banking sector the impact must be seen even as 'very substantial'. Most importantly, the bank is directly contributing to societal gender relations by offering financial products for poor people,

which is an important point of social inclusion mainly with respect to elderly and migrant women.

	Caja Madrid			Dexia		
	Output	Outcomes	Impacts	Output	Outcomes	Impacts
Share of women in top positions / equal opportunities	no explicit commitment (Board level)	XX	X	explicit commitment (Board level)	X (X)	X
Gender pay gap	No commitment	X	O	No commitment	X	O
Work-life balance	Commitment via programmes HR, Obra social	XX	XX	Commitment	XX	XX
Anti-discrim. Sexual harassment	Internal regulation	X	O	Commitment (Belgium)	X	O
Equal access to and supply of banking services	Customer trainings no microcredits (?)	X	(?)	“Guaranteeing a basic”: public communication as pilot project	X	XX
Others: sensitisation	XX	XX	XX	XX	XX	XX
Explanation: O = no improvement of CSR activities or unclear; X = improvement; XX = substantial improvement						

Table 2: Impact analysis of CSR activities for gender equality in Caja Madrid and in Dexia (Source: ISOE 2007)

4 Analysis and Explanation of CSR Success

4.1 Similarities and Differences of the Two Cases

The findings of Caja Madrid’s and Dexia’s results – outcomes and impacts on gender equality - show many similarities and some differences: Both banks have substantial outcomes and societal impacts concerning the issue of *conciliation of work and family life*. The profound improvements in *equal opportunities/ top position of women* on company level do not include the share of women in highest positions in Dexia. There is obviously a barrier to societal impact which should be examined. Furthermore, the two cases show remarkable improvements concerning *the gender pay gap*, but performance data suffers a lack of categorical transparency. Equal pay is related to internal income categories. It is not clear if bonuses are included or not. The issue of *sexual harassment* is difficult to evaluate with respect to societal impact. The issue is internally regulated in both banks. With respect to *equal access to and supply of banking services* Dexia contributes with its financial products more clearly to the societal problem of inclusiveness and poverty reduction, but Caja Madrid is contributing to societal inclusiveness with the high amount contributed to its Foundation and Social Work (‘Obra Social’). Furthermore the saving bank – as all saving banks in Spain - is communicating this as “Social Dividend” (the “second column” of financial involvement

of all saving banks). Thus, both banks contribute to the standard of inclusiveness, but with different forms of financial engagement. Additional to the above discussed gender issues the high outcome with respect to “*sensitisation for gender equality*” has to be reflected under the question of what role it plays in promoting the company’s societal impacts.

Having a look at the integration of CSR activities: commitment – strategy building – implementation and performance – there can be seen some characteristics which might be important for the analysis of success factors:

1. Outputs in CSR for gender equality: CSR instruments used and commitments in gender equality

The total lack of external codes of conducts and of explicit commitment on gender equality in Caja Madrid is surprising for a company that has such strong commitment in CSR and that shows substantial CSR impacts on gender equality. What are the driving forces for CSR activities for gender equality? Dexia also shows substantial CSR impacts on gender equality. This is unsurprising because it is well known for its commitment to gender equality deriving from the “White Paper on the situation on women in Dexia”. The bank uses a broad range of CSR instruments which includes commitment on antidiscrimination: codes of conducts as well as internal and external management instruments. A question for success analysis could be: How do they interact most effectively? What instrument constellations promote outcomes on gender equality within the company and impacts in society?

2. Strategy building and target setting

Caja Madrid has set very few targets concerning gender issues but an action plan is identified within the system of ‘Empresa Optima’ and these objectives are introduced into the annual HR action plan. Dexia has set targets for gender issues stemming from the “White Paper” which are included into the HR strategy plan. Furthermore the gender action plan deriving from the national gender diversity award systems is integrated into the annual HR strategy on the national unit level. Concerning the outcome of CSR activities both banks show no significant differences. Against this finding a question could be: Is target setting in the same way important for reaching outcomes and societal impacts?

3. Implementation

Literature stresses highly the point of ‘integration’ of external CSR commitment into internal business operations (Grosser and Moon 2005). Caja Madrid shows substantial impacts on gender equality without participating in any external codes of conduct. This raises questions on the implementation model of CSR activities in the saving bank. The hypothesis could be that the use of GRI indicators in the CSR report and a certain constellation of CSR management instruments are taking a ‘translation function’ that transports commitment into day-to-day activities (from output into outcome). Another explanation of the successful step from CSR output to CSR outcome in Caja

Madrid could be based on the function of one predominant instrument as for example the gender award system *Empresa Optima*.

The CSR implementation (integration) model of Dexia seems to be different in different entities of the Dexia Group. External management systems are used differently. For all entities ‘translation functions’ of external codes into internal codes and principles are given with respect to Principle 6 (antidiscrimination) of the Global Compact which is introduced into the HR Quality Charter. This Charter is governing all entities. In comparison to Caja Madrid the integrative model of Dexia is influenced more by target setting and monitoring/reporting in regard to social data than by overall system integration. The function of the instrument ‘gender award system’ for the implementation of CSR gender issues seems to be different in Dexia because of its national diversities which affect Dexia but not Caja Madrid.

4. Performance

Caja Madrid is using external management systems as well as internal ones. A strong integration model of all activities within the company is realised by the company’s own integrative management system: CMIPMS. Additionally the used external management system EFQM is strongly related to the CMIPMS. Both instruments seem to have a predominant role compared to other management instruments. Both are verified externally (Deloitte). Can their high level of obligation through external verification be seen as a success factor for the achieved results?

In Dexia performance measurements and reporting are under pressure from the unification process within the different entities of the Group. Integration of social data of all entities into one data base has been started with the aim of getting a more unified Human Resource management. White Paper indicators and GRI indicators are integrated in the data base and are verified externally. Internally Dexia has additional gender and diversity indicators which are not being published. The hypothesis is that performance indicators related to internal reporting are contributing more to a company’s outcome whereas indicators related to external reporting contribute more to societal gender impacts.

4.2 Analysis of the Cases along Four Questions Tackling Success

The success analysis follows research questions of the RARE team which were posed on base of a self-developed model of success factors (Viganò et al. 2006). Four research questions will be tackled:

- (1) Why are some instruments more conducive to impact than others?
- (2) What factors determine a company’s choice of instruments? [CSR output]
- (3) What factors further an effective implementation of CSR instruments within companies?

(4) Why do certain instruments create more impact on some companies than on others, even though as effectively implemented?

3.2.3 Why are some CSR instruments more conducive to impact on gender equality than others?

The hypothesis of the RARE project is that the instruments' characteristics – their inherent level of specificity and obligation - and the maturity of instruments are important success factors to create CSR impact. In the following sub-chapter this hypothesis will be discussed against the insight into instrument used in both banks.

Specificity and obligation

The understanding of 'specificity' means, that the instrument requires more specific and substantive activities than procedural improvements whereas 'obligation' means the degree of pressure to fulfilment of the instrument's obligation.

Codes of conduct: In Caja Madrid they are not used. In Dexia the *Global Compact* is important to activities that are promoting gender equality. Principle 6 of the Global Compact (the Antidiscrimination Principle) is 'translated' into the HR Quality Charter. Thus, it reaches a certain degree of specificity.

External Management Systems: High levels of obligation have instruments with external verification. In Dexia, audits are connected with the instruments EFQM and ISO which are used at the French branch. In Caja Madrid, EFQM is also externally verified.

Internal Management Instruments: Internal management instruments are more specific than external instruments. This lies in the subject of the matter of Human Relations. They are principles which regulate very specific programmes. In Caja Madrid, these internal HR instruments are successful because of the instrument constellation with the internal system's leading instrument: Caja Madrid's Integrative Management System CMIPMS, which has been verified with the EFQM model since 2003. In Dexia, the project of "Women in Dexia" has a high specificity. Internal reporting of indicators of the *White Paper* is seen by the HR manager as producing obligation. Furthermore, Dexia introduced *sanctions* for not complying with the antidiscrimination principle of external commitments (UNGC). This sanction principle is currently added in a new *Leadership Model (2006)*.

Gender Award Systems: The gender award system "*Empresa Optima*" is characterized by a high degree of *specificity* and obligation. It defines activities (gender action plan) and goal attainment will be externally monitored at the end of the agreed time frame. Most important, the system implies a follow-up mechanism. But it contains no obligation to data disclosure. With regard to the Gender Award Systems in the French, Belgium and Luxembourg entities of Dexia specificity can also be assumed. But they are not obligatory for all different entities of Dexia.

Reporting: In Caja Madrid, the CSR *report* was externally verified according to *GRI* for the first time in 2006. A good gender data base and instruments that contribute

progressively *to* data on gender issues are indispensable for creating CSR impacts on gender equality. Disclosure of data is a strong factor of obligation. Caja Madrid discloses data in its yearly CSR report including all GRI data. This data base is very poor. But the bank has more internal management indicators on workforce and gender issues which it does not publish. That is the case also for Dexia.

Lifetime of CSR instruments: Have older instruments more impact than new ones? This hypothesis is neither observable in Caja Madrid nor in Dexia.

	CAJA MADRID			DEXIA		
	specificity	obligation	follow-up	specificity	obligation	follow-up
Global Compact (plus GRI data)	–	–	–	X	XX	–
External management instruments (EFQM)	–	X	–	–	X	–
Internal management instruments	X	X	X	X	XX	X
Internal defined gender project	–	–	–	XX	XX	XX
Gender award system	X	X	XX	(X)	(X)	(X)
SR / SD Report	X	XX	X	X	X	X

Legend: – = Non existent or not relevant for CSR improvements in gender issues; x = relevant to CSR improvements in gender issues; xx = very relevant to improvements

Table 3: Conduciveness of CSR instruments to outcome on gender equality (Source: ISOE 2007)

3.2.4 What factors determine a company’s instrument choice?

The RARE project has elaborated five factors which could be influential to the choice of instrument and will be discussed in this sub-chapter for both banks:

Strategic and organisational fit

This factor is very important to both banks, but means different structures. The choice of CSR instruments in Caja Madrid was not accidental in the sense that the decision to produce a CSR report ‘fit’ with the already existing Caja Madrid integrated people management model (CMIPS) and could be used as additional element to a strong system led managerial integration model. Social commitment is stipulated in a certain way by the ‘dual column’ approach of saving banks. Gender equality is related to the strong social tradition, but this factor does not explain the choice of instruments: Caja Madrid is using GRI but is not participating in the Global Compact. The managers explained this choice with the argument that the principles of the Global Compact, which are all fulfilled by Caja Madrid, are seen as very general and are more appropri-

ate to lesser developed countries. And after linking the UNGC to GRI officially they believe that it is not necessary to participate in the Global Compact or in other codes of conduct.

Also for Dexia the ‘*strategic and organisational fit*’ is highly important to the choice of instruments. Main management instruments were implemented before the CSR strategy was established. Now, these instruments are interlinked. Dexia Group decided in 2002 to be a pioneer in sustainable development and thus, also engaged in CSR. Under the twofold business strategy: to become a pioneer in sustainable development and to relate all CSR activities to the business case, the choice of instrument was not accidental. Dexia is participating in several codes of conduct because of its objective to become a pioneer in sustainable development. Activities concerning gender equality are connected to the business case.

Factors of corporate organisation

Corporate governance in Caja Madrid is strongly stakeholder based. The stakeholder model of Caja Madrid is very specific because the Board is represented by societal stakeholders and also by representatives of the employees. This leads to a strong necessity of internal integration of different stakeholder demands. Thus, integrative instruments such as the internal management and leadership systems are selected. In contrast, the corporate organisation of Dexia is highly dependent on the unification of different former companies into one company. The main external management instruments are used differently in different entities of the Group. The strong demand of unification leads to the important role of internal management instruments and a unified social data base. A project on the situation of women in Dexia per se concerns corporate organisation.

Corporate culture

A corporate culture oriented on social traditions with a strong employee participation in Caja Madrid explains the choice of instruments insofar as it demands a high degree of integration and transparency. The system led management fulfils the integration function, the CSR report the transparency function (to external stakeholders as well as to internal stakeholders, the employees). “The report is more than a report.” (manager of quality unit). The CSR report is available in electronic form that contains interlinks to all company’s operations and units. In contrast to the tradition oriented corporate culture in Caja Madrid that of Dexia is future oriented. Because of the unification process of the different entities Dexia’s corporate culture is in the making. To introduce a ‘gender project’ was just the right instrument to influence the making of a new and long-term oriented, unified corporate culture.

Business environment: Availability and legitimacy of instrument

In Caja Madrid as well as in Dexia the use of GRI indicators was in response to the availability of this reporting instrument, also to the EFQM and Dexia’s participation in codes of conducts and SRI.

Political-institutional setting

For Caja Madrid the choice of CSR was influenced by the Spanish government that produced “Guidelines to CSR” to advise companies about the CSR issues in 2004. Caja Madrid took the “Guidelines to CSR” as a first attempt to work with this. Furthermore the choice of instrument was strongly influenced by the fact that the Spanish Ministry of Work and Social Affairs had already introduced the system “Empresa Optima”. For Dexia this factor has no high relevance. The gender award systems and diversity labels were chosen because they are being “offered” by governments and public authorities.

	CAJA MADRID	DEXIA
Strategic and organisational fit	Codes of conduct don't “fit” with demands of integrative system led management systems; Integrative leadership system “fit” with implicit gender approach,	Codes of conducts “fit” with strategic decision to become pioneer in sustainable development; White Paper on the situation of women in Dexia “fit” with decision to associate gender and diversity issues to the business case
Relevance	XX	XX
Factors of corporate organisation	Specific stakeholder model, explains high importance of integrative management systems	Demands of unification process explain high importance of internal instruments and “visibility” of the gender project
Relevance	X	X
Corporate culture	Orientation on social tradition and employee orientation explains demand on high transparency which is fulfilled by the CSR report and by the implicit gender approach	‘Gender project’ contributes to the building of a new corporate culture with strong future orientation
Relevance	XX	XX
Business environment	Use of GRI and EFQM responds to availability and legitimacy of instruments	Use of GRI, different external management instruments, codes of conducts and SRI respond to availability and legitimacy of instruments
Relevance	X	XX
Political-institutional setting	Noticeable influence to start with CSR and to take CSR report as integrative instrument, governmental base for gender award system	Certain influence by “offering” gender award systems
	XX	(X)
Legend: (x) – relevance is unclear, x – weak relevance, xx – strong relevance for choice of instrument		

Table 4: What factors determine selection of CSR instruments (Source: ISOE 2007)

3.2.5 What factors drive an effective implementation of CSR strategies and instruments?

Effective implementation of CSR is explained by six explanatory factors which are analysed for both banks:

Strategic and organisational integration: In Caja Madrid, Gender equality issues are highly integrated. They are related to Human Resources and Obra Social (Social Work), not to the bank's specific palette of financial products. The implementation model is led by internal management systems of HR and its specific programs and by the principles and programs of Obra Social. It is totally implicit. In Dexia, in contrast, the implementation model is explicit. Gender and diversity management has high strategic importance what is expressed by an internal project on the situation of women. The White Paper-project was initiated on a long-term perspective by the CEO (2004). The project was accepted by the management and passed in a gender action plan. Upper management had to be convinced that it was an economic issue and not a social issue.

Internal organisation: In Caja Madrid, regular reviews on gender issues take place at the HR management leadership level and within the management of Obra Social. The HR unit has about 100 employees. The HR gender equality related activities are mostly governed by second level persons in charge (the directors of the HR unit and Resources unit). Bottom-up initiatives of employees are given high priority. Important impulses for improvements to gender equality are coming from the Human Resource unit, as for example the initiative to participate in 'Sistema Optima'. Internal capacities for monitoring and continuous improvement are integrated into HR management. With regard to gender equality issues the involvement of internal opinion makers - especially of the six different trade unions within Caja Madrid (organisational degree is 100%) - play an important role in pursuing effective CSR implementation. They promote sub-organisations, initiatives and projects in favour of gender equality within the company. The employees are seen as the most important stakeholders by their medium level managers.

In Dexia, staff representation is not linked to representation of trade unions. The SD-Department is directly linked to the CEO. HR is in charge of the sub-part of SD which is CSR. Staff representatives on board level (organised in the European Work Council of Dexia, EWC) are participating in the CSR strategy building process. The EWC gathers the Group's Head of HR, the social relations managers of the main branches as well as 29 employee representatives from each of the branches that employ more than 150 people. Thus, internal communication activities are given high priority. Intranet was used for internal communication of the *White Paper* to all 26,000 employees. The establishment of *internal training courses for functional officers on gender equality* is one of the four main objectives and targets of the *White Paper* and thus it was integrated into the HR strategy. There is one person in charge of Gender Diversity for the entire Group. She coordinates actions in all different parts of the Group. Since 2004 a post for this has also existed at local level. Each branch supplies a person to this. The

most important impulse for internal organisation is seen in leadership support. There are regular reviews of the CSR strategy by the board. The HR management unit compiles an internal report on the development of Dexia's figures concerning Gender Diversity every year. This internal reporting system is an important success factor for implementation. Furthermore, Dexia created a *Business partner function* in different HR departments in 2005 to improve the transition from commitment to action concerning gender and diversity issues (cross-over function).

Fit with corporate culture: In Caja Madrid, norms and values which are related to the social tradition of the saving bank are an important factor for CSR implementation in general as well as to gender equality. Internal commitments have high relevance. The Integrative Personal Guidance System (SGIPS) is seen as the most important instrument for implementation of equal opportunities by HR managers. Against this background, the paragraph on gender equality within the SGIPS has to be seen as a strong 'translation mechanism' of equality principles into action plans. In contrast, corporate culture of Dexia is influenced by the fact that the company is the result of big mergers. Dexia Group has to build up a new coherent corporate culture. The bank makes strong efforts to reach this by having installed a system of internal mobility (of the employees between the different entities) that received a prize for its social benefits and learning capacities.

Civil society demand: In Caja Madrid civil society's stakeholder influence is very important because of the specific stakeholder model and the substantial influence of the employees. The women's units of the trade unions (as for example COMFIA) guarantee contact and interconnection with the societal discourse on gender equality. Furthermore, Caja Madrid's 'Obra Social' has installed a "Needs Identification Channel" which is a special instrument that functions as 'social monitor'. It uses the experiences of the employees of OS to identify 'societal needs' for the installation of programmes and activities of OS. In Dexia the CSR stakeholder approach is well known and influences the company's activities as well, but has not the same importance as in Caja Madrid.

Political-institutional setting

The political-institutional setting is very important for Caja Madrid. In Spain, the public discussion is dominated by a new law on gender equality "Organica para la igualdad efectiva de mujeres y hombres", of which a preliminary version has already been published⁶. This projected law is provoking a controversial public discussion on gender equality in Spain. It contains an obligation to elaborate an "equality action plan" for big companies and to negotiate "means for gender equality" for small and medium size companies. Furthermore, the gender award systems represent a specific form of political-institutional setting for companies. Caja Madrid and Dexia are participating in these systems. The outcomes of these systems as well as the public debate on gen-

⁶ The law (La Ley Organica) is adopted at 22 March 2007 in a modified version.

der issues are well observed by both companies. But for Dexia these instruments are less important because of national differences within its different units.

Business environment

CECA (la Confederación Española de Cajas de Ahorros), the Spanish union of all saving banks, is organising a public campaign to communicate and promote the “Social Dividend” (Dividenda Social) of savings banks. For Caja Madrid this business environment is important in the sense of benchmarking and showing their leadership in social action within the Spanish saving banks group. For Dexia the business environment is relevant because the company is listed at the stock market. Financial investors take influence on SD activities. SRI indexes and the debate on it are posing an influence. The organisational field of banks listed on the stock market is a factor explaining the choice of CSR instruments, but not that much implementation.

	Caja Madrid		Dexia	
Strategic and organisational integration	Implicit leadership support; weak actor commitment on gender equality, but total organisational integration	X	Explicit leadership support, strong actor commitment on gender equality and total organisational integration	XX
Internal organisation	Regular reviews on HR management level; Staff representation on Board level, Trade unions (their women units) important, Bottom-up initiatives within HR unit for gender activities important	X	Regular reviews on Board level, Leadership support Staff representation on Board level, Internal communication important, Business partner function for gender & diversity	XX
Fit with corporate culture	Corporate culture is norm an value oriented towards social tradition of the saving bank	XX	Corporate culture is in the making, gender diversity is future oriented and “fits”	XX
Civil society demand	Very important through trade unions and ‘needs identification channel’ (Obra Social)	XX	Stakeholder dialogues are practice,	X
Political-institut. setting	Law on gender equality and Spanish gender award system	X	Gender award systems differ in Dexia’s entities	(X)
Business environment	CECA, Social Divident, Benchmark orientation	(X)	SRI, Benchmark orientation,	X
Explanation: (x) = factor is no driver for an effective implementation or is unclear; x = factor is a driver for an effective implementation, xx = factor is a strong driver for an effective implementation				

Table 5: Factors that drive an effective implementation of CSR activities

3.2.6 Why do certain instruments create more impact on some companies than on others, even though as effectively implemented?

With respect to this question the instrument ‘gender award systems’ is interesting. It shows limits clearly in a company like Dexia which is globalising its markets. The national differences of this instrument hamper effective implementation.

4.3 Synthesis

Caja Madrid and Dexia are different in type, in size and in scope of financial activities. Dexia is stock market listed and participates in SRI, Caja Madrid not. This difference seems not to be very relevant for success of gender performance. Both companies show substantial impact on gender equality issues. Both banks demonstrate a surprising amount of activities (outcome) in those gender areas, which are seen as very important in literature on gender equality.

Two different integration (implementation) models: implicit and explicit gender approach

With regard to the implementation cycle within the company – the path from output to outcome - two different models can be identified: in Caja Madrid the intended leadership in CSR leads to a strong commitment on CSR that becomes significant in the CSR report. The CSR report has a manifold function greater than SD reports have in companies normally: it holds together two axes of the company specific CSR integration model: First it relates the CSR discourse to the integrative management system (CMIPMS) that regulates the instrumental implementation into HR strategy. Second, it relates to the internal integrative Leadership Principles (SGIP) that regulates the implementation of CSR into the orientations of the actors /employees of the company. In addition, it is a strong communication and integration instrument with regard to transparency and legitimacy of the company vis-à-vis their stakeholders and employees. The implementation process is carried highly by CSR norms and values and under them are predominantly equal opportunities values which are carried by the company’s corporate culture. CSR activities and mainly the CSR report contribute to shape the company’s culture (tradition) as well as its system led management. The instrument of the gender award system ‘Empresa Optima’ is backing the system-led implementation of gender equality issues into the HR strategy. It fits well with the strong employee and trade union’s representation. The Spanish political-institutional setting is important for success.

In Dexia, the implementation cycle begins with a strong leadership commitment to gender diversity but this is based on strategic decisions to become a pilot in sustainable development combined with the business case. The “search of talents” is a main reasoning for promoting gender equality. The decision for being a sustainable development leader and to relating this to the business case has led to the participation in many external codes of conducts as well as to the participation in gender award systems in France, Belgium and Luxemburg. The external commitments to CSR are

‘translated’ into internal commitments and into target setting management instruments. Prominent among them is Dexia’s new Leadership Principle. It has high obligation because of its bonus-malus system which is related to compliance of gender equality principles. Internal reporting to the Board is given high importance. Because of economic reasons which are due to an economic long-term strategic perspective the project “White Paper on the situation of women in Dexia” was implemented. Economic reasons and the business case are drivers for performance in gender equality. The “White Paper on the Place of Women within Dexia” was initiated in a top-down action. In Dexia, strategic decisions and an instrumental integration model that is supported by a new flexible, and global oriented corporate culture of internal commitments are supporting implementation, not traditional corporate culture of social norms and values. Against this background it is understandable why internal communication measures are highly relevant and why image factors are seen as very important. To a much lower degree external factors are decisive, as there is the business environment (SRI) and political-institutional settings, though they are also influential to a certain degree. To sum up the argument for the high importance of the ‘integration model’ for CSR implementation: the integration model has to ‘fit’ with the companies’ stakeholder relation governance form: Dexia can be characterised as ‘company-business’-stakeholder relation in contrast to Caja Madrid that can be described as a ‘company - employee’-stakeholder relation (see WP1).

5 Conclusions and Recommendations

Against the findings and arguments presented above this final chapter draws some conclusions and presents them in nine points including the most important requests addressed in this field: demands addressed to the EU/commission and their CSR framework and demands addressed to companies/the business field and further research on CSR gender equality.

1. EU Alliance for CSR and EU Commission: There is an urgent need to clarify and define gender equality as an indispensable dimension of CSR with respect to its societal impacts. Strategically, CSR for gender equality should be tied with the European gender mainstreaming strategy.

In the economic sector *gender equality* is associated with a *diversity approach* that addresses gender issues explicitly or implicitly (Cessa 2004, Freie Universität Berlin 2006). This implies the danger that gender issues ‘disappear’ behind the needs of other diversity groups and their issues. This could have happened in Dexia if the White Paper-project had not been continued (and not communicated) over the years. In 2005, the Dexia Group had in its CSR strategy a focus on the position of women; in 2006 the strategy focussed on the promotion of people with disabilities, of ethnic minorities, of seniors and juniors. Nevertheless, in Dexia the project on the situation of women has been continued. In Caja Madrid, gender equality is integrated into HR management continuously beside other ‘diversity issues’. This is good practice. Long-term imple-

mentation (integration) perspective and long-lasting actuality of the ‘topic of gender equality’ should be an indispensable element of every CSR strategy for all companies. This would be reached by relating the CSR dimension of gender equality more clearly to the EU’s gender mainstreaming strategy. Additionally it should be better defined in a structural perspective. This could be reached by describing the CSR dimension of gender equality by ‘gender issues’ which relate to the most severe ‘gender gaps’ shown in the EU equality reports. The gender issue of ‘equal pay’ should be one of them.

2. Importance of cultural dimension: Instruments which are sensitising for gender equality (against gender stereotypes) and which are introducing equality perspectives into corporate culture have high relevance for outcomes and also for societal impacts on gender equality

A surprising result of success analysis is the high importance given to ‘sensitisation’ and internal communication activities in both banks. In Dexia, the issue of equal opportunities and the project for the situation of women is continuously communicated to all employees. In Caja Madrid, HR managers see ‘sensitisation activities’ as the most successful outcome and as precondition for gender equality. So-called ‘softwiring instruments’ (Wit, Wade Schouten 2006) are indispensable for integrating CSR gender equality. They are leading to the employees’ and the managers’ orientation, gaining their ‘hearts and minds’, and at the end they influence their behaviour not only within the company, but also within society. Thus, they are promoting a societal change in the emotional basis of gendered relations which are in fact power relations. The ‘cultural prerequisites for corporate social responsibility’ (Hardjono and Marrewijk 2001) are not given for granted but should be addressed with CSR activities. Objective of these activities is to create intrinsic motivations of the actors involved and to create routines in every day practices. Furthermore, both cases demonstrate the importance of regular internal communication of CSR gender activities to all employees, what is important part of ‘soft wired instruments’. Both banks use the latest technology and diverse media (intranet etc.) to achieve good internal communications.

3. Instrument perspective: Internal CSR management instruments are more important to reach outcome at company level. External CSR instruments are indispensable to reach societal impacts. New ‘alliances’ between internal and external CSR instruments are demanded.

According to the evaluation of the interviewees contribute internal management instruments more than external instruments to the performance of CSR gender activities in both banks. Additionally, the case of Caja Madrid poses the question how far external codes of conducts as for example the Global Compact contribute to the performance of CSR in general and to the performance of CSR gender equality in particular. Caja Madrid demonstrates that a company in Europe can use GRI without the Global Compact and seems not to miss a driver for CSR. The argument of the company’s

managers should be taken seriously that this instrument could be very valuable in countries with less developed governance structures. For ‘going beyond laws in Europe’ this CSR instrument needs to be complemented by a reporting instrument such as GRI or/and an instrument constellation (‘translation mechanism’) as Dexia installed by introducing Principle 6 of the Global Compact into the company’s HR Quality Charter. Against the background of these two cases the alliance of UNGC and GRI absolutely makes sense, for the Global Reporting Initiative requires in its new Sustainability Reporting Framework G3 that all workforce data be disaggregated by gender. Further instrument alliances (the UN Global Compact with GRI and EFQM for example) should be reflected in CSR Europe and in the European CSR Alliance.

4. Actor perspective: The two cases demonstrate the high importance of winning middle level managers for CSR activities on gender equality and to bring “the voice of the employees” to strategic planning

The CEO’s commitment is identified as very important for successful implementation of CSR in both companies. In Caja Madrid, this does not include a commitment to gender equality in an *explicit* manner. But driven by a system integrated management approach, middle level managers – those of the Human Resources unit, of the Quality unit and of the unit of Obra Social, are able to implement gender equality activities successfully. In Dexia, the management had to be convinced by the CEO that the project on the situation of women was indispensable. Training courses on gender equality are offered to functional officers in both banks. Middle level managers and functional officers are very important for successful implementation. A ‘responsive’ management style that takes up ideas and initiatives from the employees (Caja Madrid) and leadership principles that imply high obligation for dealing with gender equality commitments (Dexia) are important drivers for successful CSR for gender equality on company level. Women’s voices and expertises as employees and as managers need to find expression on all hierarchical levels.

5. Integration models: The two cases show different models of implementation (integration) of CSR gender activities, an explicit model (Dexia) and an implicit model (Caja Madrid). Both models are successful because they ‘fit’ with their companies’ different internal and external stakeholder demands. Further research on successful CSR integration models of gender equality with respect to its societal impacts is needed.

The debate on gender diversity in the private sector stresses the question if there is a business case for gender equality and how stable it is to carry the wider normative perspectives (European Commission, Director General for Research, Science and Society – Women and Science 2006: 19ff.). Against the findings of the two analysed cases this seems not to be the most important question. More important seems to be to discuss integration models which contain systematic bonds (feed backs) on societal demands for gender equality. In Caja Madrid this ‘feed back’ is developed by the in-

strument of a social monitor of 'Obra Social' and to a certain extent by the Spanish gender award system of 'Empresa Optima'. Furthermore a 'two-way stakeholder approach' is fulfilling this function. In Dexia, stakeholder dialogues and continued observation of stakeholder demands and also the gender award systems are giving feed back on societal demands. Nevertheless, this feed back function could be strengthened by political and instrumental innovations.

6. Gender award systems are successful instruments to introduce CSR gender activities into companies and to organise "feed backs" between company's performances and societal demands. Their contribution to outcomes on company level would be higher for global acting companies if there would be ONE gender award system in Europe.

Both companies are participating in gender/diversity awards systems but gender awards systems are not much of a driver in Dexia because of its external status in the unification process of the company. Gender awards systems differ in France, Belgium and Luxembourg. In contrast to the internal project on the situation of women, in Dexia gender awards are not very important to achieve performance. In Caja Madrid, which has its core market in Spain, the gender award system 'Empresa Optima' is more important. Also, a unified, consistent and standardised gender awards system in Europe for all Member States should be a precondition as a driver for a company that operates in different countries of Europe and the world. Gender award systems secure long-term perspectives of promoting gender equality through positive actions for women. They should be systematically developed further to Europe's core *CSR instrument of gender mainstreaming*. It would need EU governmental backing and a solid financial base in order to be able to act independently from business sponsors in the long run.

7. Institutional and instrumental interconnections between CSR reporting of gender issues with national and EU statistics could deepen societal gender impacts. New concepts and research on this is needed.

Caja Madrid as well as Dexia shows a high amount of gender activities with very substantial societal impacts. How significant is CSR reporting / public disclosure of indicators (GRI) for the success in realising societal impacts? This question is not answered on the basis of only two cases. Data disclosure and GRI are important for Caja Madrid in developing specific instruments for HR equal opportunities which can be integrated into a general integration model. In Dexia this is not the case. Gender activities are driven more by the *White Paper* indicators which are integrated into the annual action plans of Human Resources. Furthermore, Dexia has severe problems in establishing a good gendered data base because of different laws concerning data protection in its different activity fields in Europe (data on ethnic background). Both companies are collecting more gendered data than they are disclosing, a fact that already (Grosser/Moon 2005) have detected. Beside the fact that some companies do not

want to disclose certain data because of competitive reasons, the surprising argument of the respondents in Grosser's and Moon's study was, that "gendered data are not demanded". This argument leads to the fact that disclosure of data has to refer to an economic or political 'demand'. Against this very short description of the data question one conclusion can be posed: If there were to be more systematic disclosure of data against national average data and against European average data, the success of this instrument could be strengthened even more. An interconnection of GRI data and European data on gender equality (gender equality reports) could be elaborated for example by the new EU Gender Institute. Reporting with respect to sustainability indicators and European policy goals as regards gender equality would be a further element to obtain feed back. Conceptual work on this is demanded.

8. Business environment and local authorities can give more impulses for CSR activities regarding work-life issues if they were to develop a complementary social dividend system

The European saving banks association and the Spanish Confederation of Saving Banks (CECA) demonstrate that the business environment and especially industrial associations can be an important driver for implementing CSR activities. The concept of 'social dividend', which means a concept to account and communicate publicly the amount of money spent by a company on social work (in a broader sense) could be used in a complementary form by local, regional or national authorities' to communicate publicly what companies have spent for them. For example the amount spent by Caja Madrid or Dexia/Belgium on nurseries (related to the gender issue of work-life balance) could be communicated by the bank within the amount of 'social dividend'. If the local authority of Madrid or Brussels were to disclose the amount of money saved for kindergarten costs through 'social dividend' and publish any 'cost savings' coming from the 'social dividend' they could introduce a model benchmark system for local responsibilities regarding this issue.

9. European CSR Stakeholder Forum: CSR stakeholder dialogues should include more representation of women's and gender lobby organizations

In international feminist debate the civil society organisations and the public are seen as most important to promote gender equality in the private sector (see ISOE 2004, see also Rao and Kelleher 2005, Barrientos et. al. 2003). 'Pressure' by civil society organisations regarding gender equality issues in CSR is not noticeable at the moment. There are stakeholder dialogues and a certain influence by trade unions (Caja Madrid). But gender and women lobby groups (except OXFAM) are mostly absent in stakeholder forums. CSR campaigns for gender equality issues of civil society organisations as well as the non-managerial literature on 'Gender and CSR' is focussing on supply chain management issues and within this mostly on questions of sub-contracted women work in the global production and distribution chain (Nazneen 2004; Obando 2004; Jenkins 2001; Jenkins et. al. 2002; Barrientos et. al. 2003). More women and

gender lobby presentation in the European CSR activities is demanded. The European CSR Multi Stakeholder Forum lacks in its representation women and gender lobby organisations (see also: Committee on Women’s Rights and Gender Equality 2006). A model concerning CSO representation with regard to the UN definition of “major groups of sustainable development” and means to set this into practice should be elaborated. Criteria and strategic goals for civil society representation in CSR stakeholder dialogues would make this important CSR instrument more effective.

6 References

- Barrientos, Stephanie/Dolan, Catherine/Tallontire, Anne (2003). A Gendered Value Chain Approach to Codes of Conduct in African Horticulture. In: World Development Vol. 31, No.9, pp. 1511-1526
- Browne, Jude (2002). Gender Pay Inequity: A question for corporate social responsibility? ESCR Centre for Business Research, University of Cambridge, Working Paper No. 251
- Busch, Carola (2004). Total E-Quality Award: Total E-Quality – a change paradigm on personnel management. Contribution RARE at Workshop ‘Rhetoric and Realities of Gender Activities in CSR’, Frankfurt/Main, 13th October 2004, internal document of RARE project
- Caja Madrid (2004). Igualdad de Oportunidades Profesionales. Madrid 25 Junio 2004
- Caja Madrid (2004). Algunos Datos de la Presencia de la Mujer en Caja Madrid. In: Igualdad de Oportunidades de Caja Madrid, internal information presented by HR unit of CM in December 2006
- Caja Madrid (2005). CSR Report
- Caja Madrid: Unidad de Medios (2005). Normas y Criterios de Actuación en Materia Profesional, Noviembre 2005, Madrid
- Catalyst, The (2002). Women in Leadership: A European Business Imperative (Executive Summary), New York/Brussels. Retrieved May 15, 2007, from http://www.catalystwomen.org/publications/executive_summaries/wicl-europesumm.pdf
- Catalyst, The (2004). Women and Men in U.S. Corporate Leadership: Same Workplace, Different Realities? (Executive Summary), New York. Retrieved May 15, 2007, from http://www.catalystwomen.org/publications/executive_summaries/wicl4executivesummary.pdf
- Cessa, Sara (2004). Gender dimension in CSR instruments. Internal working paper for RARE project. Frankfurt/Main.
- Commission of the European Communities (2006a). A Roadmap for equality between women and men 2006-2010, COM(2006)92 final, Brussels, 01.03.2006
- Commission of the European Communities (2006b). Report from the Commission to the Council, the European Parliament, the European Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions on equality between women and men – 2006, COM(2006)71 final, Brussels, 22.2.2006.
- Commission of the European Communities (2006c). Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, the Council and the European Economic and Social Committee: Implementing the partnership for growth and jobs: making Europe a pole of excellence on corporate social responsibility. 2006 COM (2006) 136 final, Brussels, 22.3.22006.
- Committee on Women’s Rights and Gender Equality (2006). Communication on Opinion on corporate social responsibility: a new partnership, Brussels, 27.11.2006 (2006/2133(INI))
- Conference Board, The (2006). Diversity Conference: Solving Europe’s Productivity

- Puzzle: What Role for Work-Life & Diversity? 19 - 20 October 2006 in Berlin, Germany. Retrieved November 25, 2006, from www.conference-board.org/conferences/conference.cfm?id=1193
- Council of Europe (1998). Gender Mainstreaming: Conceptual Framework, Methodology and Presentation of Good Practice. Council of Europe. EG-S.MS(98)2rev.
- Deloitte & Touche: Programa Optima (2002). Informe Tecnico de Valoracion Caja Madrid, internal document
- Dexia (2004). The Place of Women within the Dexia Group. Summary of the White Paper and action proposals. Internal paper given to RARE team. The paper can be consulted on the Group Intranet Team& Spirit Library
- Dexia (2005a). SD Report
- Dexia (2005b). La Place des Femmes chez Dexia. R union de suivi – 14 sept. 2005, internal document.
- Dexia (2005c). HR Quality Charter, internal paper
- Ebner, Hermann G. (2004). Weiterbildung von Mitarbeiterinnen, in: Krell, Gertraude (Ed.). Chancengleichheit durch Personalpolitik. Gleichstellung von Frauen und M nnern in Unternehmen und Verwaltungen. Rechtliche Regelungen - Problemanalysen - L sungen, 4. Edition, Wiesbaden, 205-220
- EGGSIE Expert Group on Gender, Social Inclusion and Employment (2005). Reconciliation of work and private life : a comparative review of thirty European countries. Synthesis report. Retrieved May 14, 2006, from http://europa.eu.int/comm./employment_social/gender_equality/gendermainstreaming/gender/exp_group_en.html
- EPWN (European Professional Women’s Network)/ Egon Zehnder International (2004b). The First ‘EPWN European BoardWomen Monitor’ – Looking Up: Women on Boards (Press Release). Retrieved January 15, 2005, from www.pnw.link.be/PWN_international/ppt_pdf/14_06g_boardwomenpressrelease_eng.pdf
- ETUC – European Trade Union Confederation, UNICE -Union of Industrial and Employers’ Confederations of Europe, UEAPME - European Association of Craft, Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises and CEEP – European Centre of Enterprises with Public Participation (2005). *Framework of Actions on Gender Equality*, Commitment and Communication 22/03/2005, Retrieved September 13, 2006, from http://ec.europa.eu/employment_social/news/2005/mar/gender_equality_en.pdf
- European Commission, Director General for Research, Science and Society – Women and Science (2006). Women in science and technology - the business perspective. Brussels. EUR 22065 EN
- European Community (1957). Treaty Establishing the European Community (short: Treaty of Rome). Retrieved January 15, 2005, from <http://europa.eu.int/abc/obj/treaties/en/entoc05.htm>
- European Community (1996/1999). Treaty establishing the European Communities (short: Treaty of Amsterdam). Retrieved January 15, 2005, from

- http://europa.eu.int/comm/employment_social/equ_opp/treaty_en.htm
- European Community (1957). Treaty Establishing the European Community, (short: Treaty of Rome), Retrieved January 15, 2005, from www.europa.eu.int/abc/obj/treaties/en/entoc05.htm
- European Multi Stakeholder Forum on Corporate Social Responsibility (2004). Results – final Forum report, June 2004, Retrieved July 7, 2004, from Eur.Activ.com Portal – Übersicht -EU Stakeholder-Forum zur sozialen Verantwortung der Unternehmen
- European Savings Banks Group (2006). Savings banks' socially responsible activities, a wealth of experience. Brussels
- European Women's Lobby (2005). Gender Equality *Road Map* for the European Community 2006–2010, Brussels, Retrieved January 16, 2006, from www.womenlobby.org
- Freie Universität Berlin (2006). Gender und Diversity: Albtraum oder Traumpaar? Eine internationale Tagung zu aktuellen Tendenzen der ‚Modernisierung‘ von Geschlechter- und Gleichstellungspolitik, 12.-14. Januar 2006, Retrieved January 6, 2006, from web.fu-berlin.de/frauenbeauftragte
- GM – Consult – MV (2003). Vereinbarkeit von Beruf und Familie aus der Sicht von Männern in der Bundesrepublik Deutschland und Schweden – Arbeitsmaterial, Rostock. Retrieved January 15, 2005, from <http://www.gm-consult-mv.org/downloads/abGMStand17.12.03KalleGesamt2.pdf>.
- GRI Global Reporting Initiative (2002). Financial Services Sector Supplement: Social Performance
- GRI Global Reporting Initiative (2006). Sustainability Reporting Guidelines. Version 3.0. Amsterdam
- Grosser, Kate (2004). Gender Mainstreaming and CSR – How can CSR contribute to advancing gender equality? Contribution RARE at Workshop ‘Rhetoric and Realities of Gender Activities in CSR’, Frankfurt/Main, 13th October 2004, internal document of RARE project
- Grosser, Kate and Jeremy Moon (2005a). Gender Mainstreaming and Corporate Social Responsibility: Reporting Workplace Issues. *Journal of Business Ethics* (2005a) 62, pp. 327–340
- Grosser, Kate and Jeremy Moon (2005b). The Role of Corporate Social Responsibility in Gender Mainstreaming. *International Feminist Journal of Politics*, 7 (4), December 2005, pp. 532–554
- Grosser, Kate and Jeremy Moon (2006). Best Practice Reporting on Gender Equality in the UK: Data, Drivers and Reporting Choices. Research Paper Series International Centre for Corporate Social Responsibility No. 35-2006
- Hafner-Burton, Emilie; Pollack, Mark A. (2002). Mainstreaming gender in the European Union. *Journal of European Public Policy* 7: 3 Special issue pp.432-56
- Halbes, Silja (2004). Consumers and CSR: Information demands and supply. Contribution RARE at Workshop ‘Rhetoric and Realities of Gender Activities in CSR’, Frankfurt/Main, 13th October 2004, internal document of RARE project

- Hardjono, Teun W. and Marcel van Marrewijk (2001). The Social Dimensions of Business. *Corporate Environmental Strategy*, Vol. 8, No. 3, pp. 223-233
- Instituto de la Mujer/Ministerio de Trabajo y Asuntos Sociales (2006). Cuestionario de diagnóstico. Internal document
- Instituto de la Mujer/Ministerio de Trabajo y Asuntos Sociales (2006). Plan de Accion Positiva. Internal document
- ISOE Institute for Social-Ecological Research (2004). Minutes of Workshop “Rhetoric and Realities of Gender Activities in CSR, Frankfurt/Main, 13th October 2004, internal document of RARE project
- Jenkins, Rhys (2001). Corporate codes of conduct: self-regulation in a global economy. United Nations Research Institute for social development. Programme paper No 2
- Jenkins, Rhys/Pearson, Ruth/Seyfang, Gill (eds.) (2002). *Corporate Responsibility and Labour Rights. Codes of Conduct in the Gobal Economy*. London: Earthscan Publications Ltd.
- Kreetz, Tanja (2005). Equal opportunity measures in the private sector in Europe. With a special focus on the banking sector. Frankfurt/Main: ISOE: Download, www.ISOE.de
- Luxembourg Presidency (2005). Report of the Luxembourg Presidency on the Progress made by the Enlarged EU following the Beijing Platform for Action (Beijing+10). Prepared by: Theisen, A. M.; Spoden, N.; Verloo, M.; Walby, S.
- Moser, Caroline (2005). Has gender mainstreaming failed? A comment on international development agency experiences in the South. *International Feminist Journal of Politics*. 7: 4. pp. 576-590
- Mujeres universia (2006). Programa Optima. Que es el programa OPTIMA? Retrieved September 24, 2006, from http://mujeres.universia.es/empleo/emprededoras/programas/programa_optima.htm
- Nazneen, Kanji (2004). Corporate Responsibility and Women’s Employment: The Cashew Nut Case. *Perspectives on Corporate Responsibility for Environment and Development*. No. 2. Retrieved September 24, 2006, from <http://www.iied.org/docs/cred/CRED Perspectives2 cashew.pdf>.
- Obando, Ana Elena (2004). Social Corporate Responsibility and the Role of the Women’s Movement. see WHRnet from AWID (Association for Women’s Rights in Development, <http://www.whrnt.org/docs/issue-corporate.html>
- Oficina Internacional del Trabajo (2006). Programa Optima „Las acciones positivas en las empresas“ – Espana. Retrieved November 20, 2006, from http://www.logos-net/ilo/195_base/es/init/spa 9.htm
- Peachy, Stephen (2006). Saving banks and the double bottom-line - A profitable and accessible model of finance. A study sponsored by World Saving Banks Institute for the World Bank and Brookings Institute Global Conference on Access to finance – May 2006, Oxford
- Rao, Aruna and David Kelleher (2005). Is there life after gender mainstreaming? In: *Gender and Development* Vol. 13, No. 2, July 2005

- Schultz, Irmgard (2007). Policy Paper on Gender Equality. Working Paper of RARE project. Frankfurt/Main.
- Shaw, Jo (2002). European Union governance and the question of gender: a critical comment, Jean Monnet Working Papers, New York University School of Law
- Stock at Stake (2004). Corporate Responsibility Research and Advice: Industry Survey: Banks – Europe, March 2004
- Thewlis, Michael, Linda Miller, Linda, Fiona Neathe (2004). Advancing women in the workplace – Statistical analysis, Working Paper Series No. 12 of the Women & Equality Unit of the Equal Opportunities EO Commission, Manchester. Retrieved May 15, 2007, from <http://www.eoc.org.uk/cseng/research/statanalysis.pdf>
- Verloo, Mieke (2005). Displacement and Empowerment: Reflections on the Concept and Practice of the Council of Europe Approach to Gender Mainstreaming and Gender Equality. *Social Politics* 12, 3, pp. 344-365
- Viganò, Federica and Daniele Nicolai (2006). CSR in the European Banking Sector: Evidence from a Sector Survey. RARE project: Working Paper, Milano
- Viganó, Federica, Franziska Wolff, Maria Bohn, Daniele Nicolai (2006b). Explaining CSR Impact. Working Paper 3 of RARE project, Milano, Berlin, Stockholm
- Walby, Sylvia (2005). Gender mainstreaming: Productive tensions in theory and practice. *Social Politics* 12, 3, pp. 321-343
- WEDO - Women's Environment and Development Organization (2002). Women and Sustainable Development 2000–2002.
- Wit, Monique de, Mark Wade, Esther Schouten (2006). Corporate Governance. Hardwiring and softwiring corporate responsibility : a vital combination. In: *Corporate Governance*, Vol. 6 No. 4, 2006, pp. 491–505
- World Economic Forum (2005). Women's Empowerment, Measuring the Global Gender Gap, London
- WSBI - World Saving Banks Institute (2006). Looking back – the achievements of 2005. Looking forward – the challenges of 2006